Middle East Refugee Crisis in Europe and Turkey: A Systematic Literature Review

Felicia Nabila Putri  
International Relation Study Program, (Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang)  
felicianabila@webmail.umm.ac.id

Salahuddin  
International Relations Study Program, University of Muhammadiyah Malang  
salahudinmsi@webmail.umm.ac.id

Syamsulrizal  
Sorong Muhammadiyah University of Education  
syamsulrizal05@gmail.com

Gonda Yumitro  
International Relations Study Program, University of Muhammadiyah Malang  
gonda@webmail.umm.ac.id  
DOI: https://doi.org/10.18196/jiwp.v7i1.10

Abstract
This study aims to discuss how the European Union and Turkey deal with the Syrian refugee crisis. The research method used in this study was a systematic literature review using 504 scientific articles sourced from the Scopus database. In reviewing the articles, the authors used the Vosviewer application. The results revealed that Syrian refugees were accommodated correctly and facilitated properly and contributed to the problem by providing insight into digital literacy, information needs, and strategies among Syrian and Iraqi refugees entering Europe and changing perspectives on migrants and refugees as passive victims of this event made to make Syrian refugee decisions to stay in Germany, in an econometric strategy based on estimating models of equality in social unity, economic integration and the decision to stay. The results contribute to developing a research roadmap on the Syrian internecine crisis in Turkey and the European Union and contribute to international relations science. Turkey and the European Union. Subsequent research must use scientific articles from other reputable international databases, such as Web of Science and Dimensions Scholars.

Keywords: Turkey, Europe, Crisis, Refugees, asylum

Abstrak
Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mebahas bagaimana cara uni eropa dan turki menangani krisis pengungsi suriah dengan metode penelitian yang diterapkan pada penelitian ini adalah systematic literature review yang menggunakan 504 artikel ilmiah bersumber dari database scopus. Review artikel menggunakan aplikasi Vosviewer. Hasil penelitian mengungkapkan bahwa pengungsi suriah di tampung dengan baik dan di fasilitasi dengan layak dan memberikan kontribusi dalam masalah tersebut yaitu dengan memberikan wawasan tentang literasi digital, kebutuhan informasi, dan strategi di antara pengungsi Suriah dan Irak yang memasuki Eropa, serta mengubah perspektif tentang migran dan pengungsi sebagai korban pasif dari persitiwa ini dibuat untuk membuat keputusan pengungsi suriah untuk tinggal di Jerman, dalam strategi ekonometrik yang didasarkan oleh estimasi model persamaan dalam kesatuan sosial, intregrasi ekonomi dan...
Introduction

Various factors, such as political conflicts in the Middle East, unfavorable economic conditions in Asian and African countries, and civil war, have caused the Syrian refugee crisis. Especially uprisings in Arab countries since 2011 have resulted in prolonged conflicts and a terrorist group called ISIS in the Middle East, which has a threatening number of members. The Arab Spring is a phenomenon of political transition experienced by Arab countries, where large-scale demonstrations demanding political reforms and regime changes are considered dictatorial. People in Arab countries want to overthrow the regime in power because they have seen as running an arbitrary government and making people miserable. Syria is one of the biggest drivers of the wave of migrants entering Europe.

The end of 2015 witnessed a global record of forced refugees fleeing war and persecution. In the previous study, many studies focused on this event which could shake the world community and make the world community start asking questions and finding out what happened to the largest refugee crisis on the European continent as well as what changed all aspects of the European order towards the crisis of Syrian refugees migrating into Europe. The unexpected arrival of refugees has proven that refugees should be accommodated in their camps in the Global South, prevented from reaching the Global North region, represented here by Europe, there are 21.3 million refugees. This number is the highest, as noted by the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) since its establishment in 1950. However, in the same year, only 107,100 refugees were accepted for resettlement through the official resettlement program, whereas 3.2 million people applied for asylum globally; prevailing reports in the world media show that more than 1 million asylum seekers reached Europe by sea in 2015 arriving illegally or illegal immigrants (Almustafa, 2022). According to (Gillespie, Osseiran, and Cheesman 2018), the role of smartphones in refugee travel explains that smartphones are a source of life, as important as water and food; Syrian and Iraqi refugees they provide planning, navigation, and travel documentation, enabling regular contact with family, friends, smugglers, and those who help them. However, refugees are simultaneously exposed to new forms of smartphone exploitation and surveillance as migration is financed by smugglers and criminalized by European policies. It tracks the risks posed by smartphones to facilitate the flow of information, communication,
and migration on digital pathways to Europe.

Previous studies also explained much about the Middle East refugee crisis in Europe, which had increased dramatically. Finally, the European Union made a policy for refugees. The European Union formed the European Asylum Support Office (EASO) (European Union Agency for Asylum) organization this organization was formed to protect and deal with refugee problems in the region. Europe and strengthening the implementation of the Common European Asylum System (CEAS) and taking a cooperative approach with third world countries, which are the origins of immigrants. Although many previous studies have explained the European Union’s efforts towards the Middle East refugee crisis, little research has focused on cyber security or the digital world. Few previous studies have used the systematic literature review approach with articles from the Scopus database, and few have used the article review method with the Vosviewer application. Therefore, this study focuses on reviewing papers with a systematic literature review approach that used 506 scientific articles sourced from the Scopus database. The systematic literature review method is a scientific method that has strengths and advantages in understanding research issues based on previous research.

The focus of this research study leads to efforts to answer research questions, namely, how the events of the Middle East Refugee Crisis in Europe affect changes in the European digital system. The research method used is a systematic literature review using the Scopus database. This research contributes to developing a European digital system development study after the Middle East Refugee Crisis in Europe.

Literature Review

This topic was often discussed in previous research because of the boom in refugees from the Middle East, especially refugees from Syria, because it is a critical aspect in developing the science of international relations. The number of refugee crises in various parts of European countries is one of the problems currently being handled by the European Union. From 2013 to 2015, refugees from Syria occupied the most positions in Germany, with an open-door policy.

This conflict occurred because of a civil war in the small town of Bernama Deena and the border town with Jordan. Sparked the anger of the tribes, residents, and families. At the end of 2012, the military seemed to be approaching a stalemate. Rebel fighters have taken control of northern Syria but face difficulties supplying equipment, weapons, and organizational aspects. Meanwhile, the government forces are also weakening due to many apparatus turning to the opposition. Fighting continues daily in contested areas, resulting in a higher civilian death toll.

Therefore, many Syrian citizens affected by the civil war conflict fled to European countries. Due to its geographical location and limited by the Mediterranean Sea, it is easy for refugees from Syria to use ships to reach the European region. The European Union’s economy is also one of the reasons it is their destination.

Migrants can adjust their goals whether to settle in migrating, with relative offers offered through the media. Migrants widely use social media to determine certainty during and before settling in interviews with
54 Syrian migrants who have recently obtained refugee status in the Netherlands. The interviews showed that most Syrian migrants accessed information from several media before and during migration, using smartphone technology (Dekker et al., 2018). For them, migrating to Europe requires a complex range of information, including how to find information, get valid information, and the costs involved because accepting the wrong information can lead to death, loss of family, or financial ruin. To contribute to this problem by providing insight into digital literacy, information needs, and strategies among Syrian and Iraqi refugees who entered Europe in 2015, as well as changing perspectives on migrants and refugees as passive victims of international events and policies (Borkert, Fisher, and Yafi 2018).

Turkey’s response is a country with solid capabilities or a great power country. Europe is establishing cooperation with Turkey in an immigrant asylum. Turkey began accepting refugees from Syria in 2011 and is hosting the highest number of refugees, with more than 3.5 million Syrians and half a million from other countries, mainly from Afghanistan, Iraq and Iran. Changes to Turkey’s citizenship law have brought a peak in migration flows (Akcapar & Simsek, 2018). In March 2016, the European Union (EU) and Turkey agreed that refugees who entered Greece illegally would be returning to Turkey. It is an effort to stem the tide of refugees fleeing from the Middle East, as a reference for Turkey and Europe’s agreement to make exchanges between the Christian community in Turkey sent to Greece and the Greek Muslim community sent to Turkey in return (Goalwin, 2018). The flow of Syrian refugees coming to Turkey also significantly impacts company performance, and accommodating refugees can benefit companies and substantially increase the number of new foreign-owned companies (Akgündüz, Van Den Berg, and Hassink 2018).

Due to lingering concerns regarding the health of Syrian refugees after the civil war, the Canadian Government provided health facilities in the Greater Toronto Area (GTA) that aim to meet the healthcare needs of Syrian migrant women in a timely and comprehensive manner requiring coordinated multi-sector initiatives that can overcome barriers. Financial, social, and structural for access and use of their services (Guruge et al., 2018). In semi-structured interviews and thematic analysis to investigate the main challenges young people face and their primary resources to overcome them. One-third of refugees in Germany are youth or adolescents aged 14 to 18 years. Overcoming their challenges requires social support from friends, family, social services or organizations, and themselves through avoidance, persistence, actively seeking, and active involvement in an activity. (Alhaddad, Goodwin, and Kanngiesser, 2021)

The 2016 IAB-BAMF-SOEP refugee survey was created to decide Syrian refugees to live in Germany in an econometric strategy based on estimating models of equality in social cohesion, economic integration, and the decision to stay. Generate two kinds of contributions: Our first contribution is to show that economic integration impacts social integration only for refugees with low and middle education. Our second result is that social integration influences the intention to live in Germany, whereas economic integration does not (Hannafi & Marouani, 2018).
According to the latest empirical data, 484 young Syrian refugees formed into two types of refugees whom the British Government resettled. Thus, it attempts to contribute to the debate about the process and implications of how host countries label people, in this case, by treating de facto resettled Syrian refugees as ‘good’ refugees. At the same time, regardless of need, those who arrived of their own accord are seen as more problematic. (Karyotis, Mulvey, and Skleparis, 2021)

During the Covid-19 pandemic, Syrian refugees who were in Kilis, Turkey, had a different life from the level of standardization in preventing and fighting the Covid-19 pandemic, resulting in a high level of sensitivity in fighting the pandemic. Some groups do not have sufficient information about the pandemic and cannot reach personal protective equipment. Refugees’ compliance level with the rules and their findings that decisions are taken and appropriately implemented (Budak & Bostan, 2020) because the high frequency of COVID-19 has impacted the psychological health of all countries and socio-economic groups worldwide, plus refugees who bear the brunt of it. The Government of Canada has the initiative to help improve the mental welfare of Syrian refugees who are aged or elderly by creating a method: A convenience sample or convenience sample that is measured using the Fear of COVID-19 Scale (FCV-19S). (Sharif-Esfahani et al. 2022)

In previous articles, Syrian refugees migrated to the European continent because of their exact geographical location and easy travel by sea. Furthermore, Syrian refugees are welcome by the European Union. The European Union’s policy in the grip of refugees seeking asylum is enshrined in law. In the Dublin Convention, which was signed in 1990 and only entered into force in 1997, in the Act, refugees coming to the territory of the European Union must apply for asylum in the first country to set foot in and protect them following the 1951 Geneva Convention. Moving on and not exploring other European countries. The migration issues discussed in this agreement are: Adding the Schengen Agreement to the Maastricht Agreement, Making asylum, visas, and immigration a standard policy. The European Union created the 5 Priority Policy Pacts that set common standards and the basis for shaping the national policies of each EU member state for migration. The formation of this pact is based on the interests of the European Union and the development of the countries of origin of immigrants so that both can contribute to and support each other.

**RESEARCH METHODS**

This study used a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) approach, part of library research. A systematic Literature Review (SLR) includes a series of evaluations of previous research, mapping concepts and research themes based on previous research, critically analyzing previous research, and then processing the synthesis of previous research findings.

This study used a systematic literature review with articles from the validated Scopus database and used the Vosviewer application. Therefore, this study focuses on review papers using the SLR approach, using 506 scientific articles from the Scopus database. The SLR method is a scientific method with advantages and disadvantages in understanding the problems of previous research studies.

In the research phase, the researchers...
used the Scopus database by entering the keywords Middle East refugee crisis and found 3,481 documents. The selection of document types was articles with the choice of language, like English, with a period of the last four years. With the selected format, 506 articles were obtained. The Mendeley application can access the data, which can view sensitive information in obtaining materials verified for authenticity, such as the author’s name, year, keywords, journal publication location, and abstract. The collected material was then reclassified, reduced, and analyzed using the VOSviewer software. Then the Vosviewer application as a tool in research. Vosviewer here functions to map essential points to be explained in research. This tool also helps to sort out which data will be used in research later.

**Result and Discussion**

**Figure 1.** Article analysis by year of publication

![Figure 1: Article analysis by year of publication](https://example.com/figure1)

**Source:** Scopus documents by years

Figure 1 shows the year of the article published about the Middle East Refugee Crisis in Europe and Turkey. The data graph originating from Scopus shows that in 2018 there were 70 published articles. Then in 2019, the publication of these articles increased to around 94. In 2020 these articles decreased to only 90 articles. The highest increase in published articles occurred in 2021, with almost 160 articles, but in 2022 it decreased to only 90. The average productivity of journal publications with the theme Middle East Refugee Crisis in Europe and Turkey in 4 years indexed by Scopus from this data reaches 126 articles annually.
The following is data from the Scopus database regarding authors who have published their articles from 2018 to 2022. Judging from the Scopus database graph above shows that ten authors have a percentage of published articles within four years starting from the year 2018-2022. With nine authors, an average percentage of 4 articles has been published, namely: Acarturk, C.; Carpi, E.; Dajani, R.; Fakhoury, T; Ikkursun, Z.; Panter-Brick, C.; Roberts, B.; Saleh, S.; and Shuayb, M. followed by one author with five published articles namely Hadfield, K.

**Figure 2.** Article analysis based on authors

**Figure 3.** Analysis of article data based on country of origin

**Source:** Scopus documents by Authors

**Source:** Scopus documents by country
The graph above displays the graphical data obtained from Scopus about the country of origin of the articles that have been collected. According to the graph of data on country of origin, the article that discusses the Middle East refugee crisis in Europe and Turkey shows the United Kingdom as the country that published the most articles from 2018 to 2022, with 156 articles, followed by the United States with 95 articles. Turkey occupies the third position with the most, above the Netherlands, Lebanon, Germany, Canada, Jordan, Sweden, and Switzerland are in the 10th position with the most published articles. If analyzed with the naked eye, countries in the top 10 significantly influence this article. In particular, references to Britain’s role in providing refuge to Jewish refugees fleeing Nazi Germany serve as a hegemonic narrative that reinforces Britain’s “heroic” position and constructs the Syrian conflict as involving an oppressive dictator and innocent refugees needing help, thus legitimizing support for Syrian refugees. (Kirkwood, 2019)

**Figure 4. Bibliometric analysis of article data**

Articles obtained from Scopus will be visualized and grouped by keywords through the Vosviewer application. The result will be in the form of several interconnected networks between articles. The following is the linkage data between the keywords in the Syrian and crisis-themed articles produced by Vosviewer.

Vosviewer identified several clusters based on keywords from each article included as data for bibliometric analysis. Each circle represents a keyword derived from the article title and abstract. Circle size indicates the number of publications associated with that keyword in the journal and journal abstracts. A larger circle indicates more articles related to that keyword and vice versa. Analysis shows that 124 of 132 items were identified and grouped into 4 clusters. Each cluster has a different color that indicates a list of different or more dominant concepts from each cluster. To identify as many topics

**Source: Vosviewer Network visualization**
frequently discussed in research to use in future research. The 2 clusters have the largest network marked in red and green.

Table 1: Themes Clustering in Middle East Refugee Crisis in Europe and Turkey

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Red / Cluster 1</td>
<td>Account, article, Asylum, asylum seeker, case, concept, crisis, discourse, Europe, example, fear, focus, form, Germany, Government, identity, influx, large number, law, city, medium, migrant, migration, narrative, refuge, refugee crisis, refugees, resettlement, response, return, right, security, society, space, state, question, place, protection, politic, possibility, principle, status, Syrian Syrian civil war, Syrian crisis, Syrian refugee crisis Syrian refugee woman, threat, vulnerability, war</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green / cluster 2</td>
<td>Addition, age, barrier, basis, capacity, care, consequence, control, effect, exposure, factor, gap, gender, Greece, health, host community, individual, intervention, Iraq, march, mental health, middle east, month, participant, region, respondent, risk, self, service, social support, survey, Syrian conflict, violence</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue / cluster 3</td>
<td>adaption, Arabic, attitude, Canada, child, communication, difference, discrimination, education, English, family, field, knowledge, language, measure, Netherlands, parent, problem, refugee child, relationship, sample, school, semi, student, Syrian refugee child, teacher, trauma, view</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yellow / Cluster 4</td>
<td>Civil war, covid, Istanbul, outbreak, pandemic, solidarity</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cluster 1, or those marked in red, have links to matters that include the Syrian civil war, the Syrian crisis, the Syrian refugee crisis for women, Syrian refugees, threats, vulnerabilities, war and others. When connected to this research, the relevant articles are by (Lokot, 2019) entitled The Space Between Us: Feminist Values and Humanitarian Power Dynamics in Research with Refugees, which discusses
research on Syrian refugees and humanitarian workers in Jordan. This article explores international humanitarian agencies’ research, monitoring, and evaluation practices. Suggests that an emphasis on generating evidence has resulted in more transactional and less relational engagement with refugees.

Cluster 2, marked in green, contains keywords mainly referring to social services and mental health. Social support is also found in countries such as Greece. An article related to cluster 2 and the theme is an article entitled Perceptions and Health-Seeking Behavior for Mental Illness Among Syrian Refugees and Lebanese Community Members in Wadi Khaled, North Lebanon: A Qualitative Study written by (Al Laham et al., 2020) which discusses how to fight mental health is associate with stigma, shame and fear among the two populations with Beliefs around mental illness strongly associated with religious beliefs, including jinn. Religious healers are considered a line of first aid for people with mental illness and are considered culturally acceptable and less stigmatizing than Mental Health professionals. Mental Health professionals need to build trust with the communities in which they work. Collaboration with traditional healers is key to identifying mental health symptoms and creating referral pathways to mental health professionals in this context.

Then in the cluster 4 section marked in blue, some keywords lead to covid, pandemic, and civil war. Articles related to cluster 3 and the theme, entitled Syrian Refugees’ Experiences of Housing Stability during the COVID-19 Pandemic: Barriers to Integration and Just Solutions by (Rabiah-Mohammed et al., 2022), which discusses how to demonstrate the negative consequences of the COVID-19 pandemic for refugees and low-income households, including health-related problems and economic challenges, which may worsen their ability to obtain decent and affordable housing utilizing reviewing the experiences of Syrian government aid refugees during the pandemic. Based on our findings, we discuss potentially relevant policy and practice solutions to challenges faced by refugees in Canada during the pandemic and possibly beyond.
The following is density visualization analysis data which shows that each keyword has a difference in color intensity and that keywords with a lighter color or tend to be lighter means that these keywords are more widely or frequently discussed in published articles. The dominant keywords discussed are topics related to this research with topics discussed previously.

Before conducting research, it is necessary to evaluate the previous research related to the discussed topic. Researchers need to understand what is being discussed and the direction of the problem related to the topic discussion. Visualizing this data density will make it easier for researchers to determine the focus of the topic related to the desired research. Based on the density of visualization that has been done, several keywords have bright colors indicating that these keywords are often discussed in previous research, such as the words Syrian refugee crisis, female refugees, articles, and migration to civil war. The relationship between these words has a complex argumentative quality that allows us to draw relevant conclusions and is very closely related to the Middle East Refugee Crisis theme in Europe and Turkey.

**Discussion results**

The European Union has tried to differentiate itself as respecting human rights in its migration policy. One of the EU’s responses was to declare war on “criminal gangs” of people smugglers and traffickers, which are reportedly responsible for a spike in refugee deaths. In 2015 the mass drowning in the seas of refugees from war-torn and despotic countries such as Syria and Eritrea began to increase with the end of Mare Nostrum, the Italian navy’s search and rescue operation in the Mediterranean. The military had solutions for refugee escapes that kept being proposed. A second securitization measure continued to target smugglers and traders. However, this time the object of reference became the West itself. The European Union then equated the activities of the smugglers with the new slave trade. This securitization measure
failed to gain legitimacy from the public and EU media. (Hintjens 2019)

In addition to the European Union, which hosts Syrian refugees, Turkey also hosts many Syrian refugees, and Turkey facilitates Syrian refugees by continuing education in all sectors. However, this paragraph will discuss how refugee students build access points to higher education with Syrian students studying in various universities in Turkey. Refugees demonstrated that access to university is intersectionally shaped by personal ambition, family encouragement, community support, and social and educational policies in an abilities-based human development paradigm that outlines the factors that enable students to transition to university and looks at how they navigate the complex spaces of higher education. On the other hand, their educational experience highlights that higher education functions as a site of justice where everyday racism, xenophobia, and discrimination are reduced significantly by providing a peaceful and safe space to coexist with others regardless of financial constraints. (Çın and Doğan, 2021)

Conclusion

This topic was often discussed in previous research because of the boom in refugees from the Middle East, especially refugees from Syria because it is essential in developing the science of international relations. The number of refugee crises in various parts of European countries is one of the problems currently being handled by the European Union. From 2013 to 2015, refugees from Syria occupied the most positions in Germany, with an open-door policy.

This conflict occurred because of a civil war in the small town of Bernama Deena and the border town with Jordan. Sparked the anger of the tribes, Residents, and Families. At the end of 2012, the military seemed to be approaching a stalemate. Rebel fighters have taken control of northern Syria but face difficulties supplying equipment, weapons, and organizational aspects. For them, migrating to Europe requires a very complex range of information, including how to find information, get valid information, and the costs involved because accepting the wrong information can lead to death, loss of family, or financial ruin. To contribute to this problem by providing insight into digital literacy, information needs, and strategies among Syrian and Iraqi refugees who entered Europe in 2015 and changing perspectives on migrants and refugees as passive victims of this incident—created to decide Syrian refugees to live in Germany, in an econometric strategy based on estimating models of equality in social cohesion, economic integration and the decision to stay. Generate two kinds of contributions: Our first contribution is to show that economic integration impacts social integration only for refugees with low and middle education. Our second result is that social integration affects intentions to live in Germany, whereas economic integration does not.

This research method used a systematic literature review, which means writing through the results of a review of various reference articles that are relevant and reliable to the cases raised. Then it has undergone various document screening processes with the format the author expects. So this research can also be reviewed again as a supporting article with the same research method. This writing has limitations, only with supporting articles
used only sourced from article data presented through the Scopus database. This study has less room for movement because the data used as a reference is only through Scopus. Accessing data via Scopus also requires quite a lot of money. However, most of the data available in Scopus cannot be specific according to research needs. So that the researcher must filter the writing so that in this writing it has relevant data.

Bibliography:


